

**Irina Panovska Chronological Class List**

**The University of Texas at Dallas**

**Selected Responses to key Questions: Median, Mean (Standard deviation). All scores are out of 5.**

**The summary below includes the key evaluation questions. A full list of responses for all questions in the survey with full list of student comments available on request.**

**The numerical summaries for all questions used in the student evaluation surveys are also publicly available on the UT Dallas CourseBook website for the corresponding semester <https://coursebook.utdallas.edu/>**

**The selected student comments included below are not redacted except for evaluations when students included their name in the free responses.**

**Fall 2025. 2 Classes: Econ 4385 (undergraduate elective, in person), Econ 4386 (undergraduate elective, in-person with additional virtual collaboration with students from the University of Marburg)**

	<b>Econ 4385</b>	<b>Econ 4386</b>
Eligible to Respond	28	23
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.86, 4.76 (0.44)	5, 5 (0)
The course was well organized	4.65, 4.59 (0.51)	4.97, 4.94 (0.24)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.56, 4.53 (0.51)	4.85, 4.76 (0.17)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.94, 4.88 (0.33)	4.97, 4.94 (0.24)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.79, 4.71 (0.47)	4.93, 4.88 (0.33)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.89, 4.82 (0.39)	5, 5 (0)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.79, 4.71 (0.47)</b>	<b>4.93, 4.88 (0.33)</b>
Response Count	17	17

**Selected comments Fall 2025**

**Econ 4385**

1. The mix of homework, quizzes, and final project to determine our grade, the quality of teaching (as good as the best teachers I've had and those teachers taught subjects that were easier, at least for me), the lack of dependence on a central textbook should all stay the same. One specific thing that I [sic] very strongly about is the option to present our final projects and receive feedback before the final project is due, and making us present 11 days before the project is due. I didn't think that making the presentation that early was a good idea, but in hindsight it was genius. The prospect of presenting the project to a live audience, including the professor herself, knowing we will be asked questions forced us to think a lot more about our ideas and the economic and statistical concepts behind them. Making the presentation time that early allows for feedback and the time to implement them, and it also frees up some time to work on other assignments/exams during finals week. All in all, this was a great idea and it should definitely stay the same.
2. The organized teaching of R concepts from basic fundamentals to more complicated topics
3. I really appreciate the connections that the professor made between the course content and work we do and our futures, telling us of how we can present the skills we learn in class in an interview or how we can put them on our resumes. I can't remember any other professor doing this and I very much appreciate it, and I think it will be useful for my life inside, outside, and after UTD
4. I'm very happy to have Panovska as a professor as she is very knowledgeable but also caring and understanding. She did a wonderful job and I never felt like she was belittling me if I had a lack of

knowledge. Thank you to Dr. Panovska for being excellent, not only as a professor, but also as a human being.

5. Spread the work out some more, some weeks were litttt (sic)
6. I would have liked more in-class assignments

**Econ 4386**

1. I really enjoyed the VE COIL and how it was structured. I think the project both allowed us to use our skills that we had developed while remaining somewhat simple to work on with students from Germany
2. I loved this class. I am vehemently against group projects but the VE COIL aspect of this course was actually quite exciting and a nice change of pace for the semester.
3. Dr. Panovska was an amazing professor who is clearly knowledgeable in econ omics. She was so helpful both inside and outside of the classroom and did a really good job of tying concepts to current events and making difficult concepts more understandable
4. Everything was wonderful
5. All of it was great! So far the best Economics class ive had in my time at UTD
6. The variety in the type of assignments used to us us our grade, the willingness to explain concepts and answer clarifying questions, the pace of the course, and the general contents of the class, in particular the frequent connections to the real world and to the policies being implemented in real time should all remain the same
7. It would be nice if the course was not at 8:30am
8. Everything was fantastic but Dr. Panovska needs to become a Lions fan

**Spring 2025. 2 Classes: Econ 4385/ 5397 (cross listed as undergraduate and MS class, hybrid in-person and online), Econ 7391: Business Cycles (PhD field class, in-person)**

	<b>Econ 4385: Business and Economic Forecasting (Undergraduate, Cross Listed Hybrid)</b>	<b>Econ 5397: Business and Economic Forecasting (MS, Cross Listed Hybrid)</b>	<b>Econ 7391: Business Cycles (PhD, In person)</b>
Eligible to Respond	30	4	8
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.79, 4.65 (0.59)	5,5 (0)	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
The course was well organized	4.88, 4.75 (0.55)	5,5 (0)	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.79, 4.60 (0.68)	5,5 (0)	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.88, 4.75 (0.66)	5,5 (0)	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.73, 4.65 (0.49)	5,5 (0)	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.83, 4.70 (0.57)	5,5 (0)	4.83, 4.75 (0.46)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.88, 4.80 (0.41)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
Response Count	20	1	8

**Selected comments Spring 2025**

**Econ 4385**

9. I enjoyed how structured the class was
10. I liked the division of information between lectures, HW, and quizzes
11. The weekly homeworks working with the R code was very helpful. Everything should stay the same

12. The easy to understand way that the course introduces R and assumes you don't have prior coding language makes the class beginner friendly, teaching in an intuitive way
13. I believe the final project should remain the same. It was a very fun way of putting our class knowledge into use.
14. Professor Panovska is a wonderful instructor. She ensures that what we learn can be applicable to many different fields, and gives us that flexibility in our lectures! Her lectures are great and should remain the same.
15. I had a great experience and learned some very valuable skills.
16. Overall I greatly enjoyed this course. The homework were all incredibly helpful towards the final project and I have learned a lot regarding coding.

**Econ 7391**

1. I liked being able to work on my dissertation
2. The presentation aspect was great
3. The amount of presentations was a little much
4. The coding aspect should remain the same

**Fall 2024 (2 Classes, in person)**

	<b>Econ 6302 Macroeconomic Theory 1 (PhD 1<sup>st</sup> year core)</b>	<b>Econ 4396: Special Topics in Economics Contemporary Macroeconomic Policy (Undergraduate)</b>
Eligible to Respond	13	25
The course objectives were clearly defined	5, 5(0)	4.95, 4.90 (0.30)
The course was well organized	5, 5 (0)	4.91, 4.85 (0.37)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.94, 4.98 (0.33)	4.88, 4.80 (0.41)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	5, 5 (0)	4.94, 4.90 (0.31)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.86, 4.78 (0.44)	4.79, 4.65 (0.59)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	5, 5 (0)	4.91, 4.80 (0.52)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>5, 5 (0)</b>	<b>4.88, 4.80 (0.41)</b>
Response Count	9	21

**Selected comments Fall 2024**

**Econ 4386 (included VE Coil component and collaborative project with Students in Macroeconomics 2 from the University of Marburg in Marburg, Germany)**

- I suppose everything is just perfect with this class. It allows for great flexibility and Dr. Panovska has done an excellent job at explaining complex economic models. It is a very fun class too because we get to work on the COIL project.
- The quizzes are a good marker of whether I understood a concept that was covered in class during the week.
- I really enjoyed the virtual exchange portion as well as examples used in every class, from FRED snapshots to news articles related to what we were discussing that day.

### Econ 6302

- The course overall is very good, I think the tests, type of homework, and structure of the quizzes should stay the same
- The professor demonstrates exceptional clarity in explaining complex topics, making learning engaging and accessible. The lectures are extremely well structured and planned, Dr. Panovska obviously knows what she's (sic) doing, passion for the subject. Office hours, lecture plans, video tutorials. The professor is consistently well-prepared and punctual, ensuring that class time is used productively.

### Spring 2024 (2 classes, Econ 3311 in person, Econ 4385/ 5397 cross listed hybrid class)

	<b>Econ 3311 Intermediate Macroeconomics (Undergraduate Required Core Class)</b>	<b>Econ 4385: Business and Economic Forecasting (Undergraduate)</b>	<b>Econ 5397: Business and Economic Forecasting (MS)</b>
Eligible to Respond	33	30	14
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.88, 4.81 (0.40)	4.96, 4.93 (0.27)	4.93, 4.88 (0.35)
The course was well organized	4.88, 4.81 (0.40)	4.92, 4.79 (0.58)	5, 5 (0)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.88, 4.81 (0.40)	4.86, 4.79 (0.43)	4.93, 4.88 (0.25)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.97, 4.94 (0.25)	4.96, 4.93 (0.27)	5,5 (0)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.92 4.87 (0.35)	4.96,4.93 (0.27)	5,5 (0)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	5,5 (0)	4.92, 4.86 (0.36)	5, 5 (0)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.96,4.93 (0.26)</b>	<b>4.96,4.93 (0.27)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>
Response Count	16	14	8

### Selected comments Spring 2024

#### Econ 3311:

- I really appreciate the option of being able to access recordings of the class. They're done really well as they're a great support if you miss class or want to review what we're learning but they're also never going to be the same and as helpful as being in class. It's a good balance that makes coming to class still rewarding without having this added anxiety over potentially missing class. The data is also very interesting! It makes certain concepts so much clearer when the real world affects and causes can be pointed out. It's also a great introduction to a great resource to continue to track after this class because of how relevant it is to everyday life.
- This course was excellent. Dr. Panovska was amazing. She is a wonderful teacher and is incredibly caring for students. Her course is challenging but she makes it easy.
- The class was great and well taught. I appreciated having an option to ask questions on the quizzes. This is very helpful so we can ask questions if we think of them on the weekend and I know some people are shy and would not like to speak up in class. Therefore, I think this was a great thing. I also liked how we always talked through and worked through all the equations, numbers, data, and graphs.

- I enjoyed this course and learned a lot from it. One aspect that should remain the same is the quizzes. I used my first attempt at completing the quizzes as a way to measure how much I know and how much I need to review. The exams were fair in terms of content and grading. We also received feedback on our homework with plenty of time to study for exams.
- Was a great course
- Everything, taking this class with Dr. Panovska was a blessing.
- I love the untraditional way of learning through actually analyzing economic data. Not only was I able to learn the class concepts better, but it definitely developed my analytical skills.
- I feel as though nothing should change. All due dates and assignments were related to course material and aided in preparing for exams and extending knowledge.
- The grading was clearly outlined and the structure was great, everything built on the last thing we did. The homework and quizzes did an excellent job at preparing me for the exams. It's really impressive considering the lack of textbook and focus on real-world issues. It makes it a much-needed complement to other theory-heavy economics courses.
- The grading composition was very helpful to the students and showed a genuine concern for student learning and understanding. I liked the weekly quizzes as a way to refresh the concepts studied that week and also as a way to help study for the exams. The homework was also very doable and understandable. Above all I appreciated the professor recording lectures for students who could not be there and posting them later. This was easily the most organized course I have taken at UTD

**Econ 4385/5397:**

- I really enjoyed the homework assignments and the tutorials that Dr. Panovska posted. I believe those should remain the same.
- The projects and presentations at the end of the course were very valuable. The homeworks were extremely helpful to get fully immersed and hands-on despite having little background with the program.
- Everything! I love how organized and accommodating this class is. Professor Panovska is always the best.
- Dr. Panovska is a great instructor for this course. She explains everything with a focus on intuition, which is refreshing for the typical math driven approach that can arguably be less intuitive. She is also an expert in economic theory.
- I appreciate the balance between forecasting theory and R application
- I like the variation in coding topics. The additional assignments for graduate students helped me gain a better understanding of the functions. The asynchronous modality made attending class much easier.
- The content and the homeworks. All the material learned in this class can be applied to any of the other economics classes.
- This is an ideal course which helps you to learn a lot.
- Homework and quizzes work well and reinforce the lectures by putting the learning into regular practice

**Fall 2023 (2 Classes, in person)**

	<b>Econ 6302 Macroeconomic Theory 1 (PhD 1<sup>st</sup> year core)</b>	<b>Econ 4396: Special Topics in Economics Contemporary Macroeconomic Policy (Undergraduate)</b>
Eligible to Respond	14	25
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.94, 4.80 (0.63)	4.93, 4.88 (0.34)
The course was well organized	4.94, 4.80 (0.63)	4.93, 4.88 (0.34)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.94, 4.80 (0.63)	4.83, 4.75 (0.45)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.94,4.80(0.63)	5,5 (0)
The instructor communicated information effectively	5, 5 (0)	4.97,4.94 (0.25)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	5,5 (0)	4.97,4.94 (0.25)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.94,4.80 (0.25)</b>	<b>4.97,4.94 (0.25)</b>
Response Count	10	16

**Selected comments Fall 2023**

**Econ 4386 included VE Coil component and collaborative project with Students in Macroeconomics 2 from the University of Marburg with Marburg Germany. This was the first time that I had incorporated a VE COIL component in a class. I encouraged the students to provide feedback about what worked and what did not work in the VE COIL component.**

**What should remain the same**

1. this class is awesome and i really enjoyed the course
2. I like the amount of quizzes and homeworks. I also like the takehome application exam
3. I liked how well-organized the course was. I appreciated the reminders about assignments and the careful planning that Dr. Panovska put into our class. I liked the structure of the take-home exams and topic organization.
4. Material was interesting, Dr. Panovska was passionate about the subject matter, and I enjoyed the discussion of current events/real world examples.
5. The content, the projects and schedule for topics and classes.
6. Most of it. Especially the group project. Even if it will not always be an international affair.
7. I really liked how each topic was broken up into groups so that I could clearly identify what I was having difficulty understanding. Further, the group project in the VE COIL format was a great addition because it was interesting to work with other people from different countries and also work through data with them.
8. Connecting the real-life data to the macro was neat. The VE COIL project was a nice experience. I liked the level of engagement and passion from the professor.
9. Best Econ professor hands down! Everything should stay the same. Everything is easy to follow, and it's hard to forget the material because Dr. Panovska gives us constant reminders.
10. I hate doing weekly quizzes but that is just laziness on my part
11. you were a great professor and really knowledgeable about macroeconomics. Thank you and take care!
12. Enjoyed the class overall, assignments and courseload felt "just right"
13. No additional comments. I really enjoyed this class and learned a lot about economic trends and how to evaluate macroeconomic data.

14. Homework was helpful, it never felt like busy work and it always related to our exams. VE COIL project felt a little stressful at times just because of how hard it was to schedule with our German teammate, but it was graded fairly and the work wasn't actually hard. Overall awesome class.
15. Amazing professor, fair grading, learned a lot in this class.
16. Made macroeconomics a 'living subject', and connected a lot of hereto disparate concepts of formal economics for me.

#### **Suggestions for changes Econ 4386**

17. I think one thing that might be helpful is more time on the VE Coil project.
18. Too much lecture time is spent on logistical stuff like reminders of due dates
19. Maybe more practice problems sets for certain more advanced modeling approaches.
20. I think I would have appreciated slowing down in units when we compiled all the graphing aspects of the class. It wasn't anything detrimental but it did take me a little bit more time to grasp the ideas because we had gone through it faster in class.
21. It was not always entirely clear to me which content we were working on since we did so many graphs in class away from the PowerPoint slides, and so many of the slides were skipped over. My biggest suggestion for improving the course is to consolidate the PowerPoint slides to just those that we covered in class and to reference the remaining slides when drawing the graphs on the board. This way students will be able to connect the in-class graphs to the relevant PowerPoint slides. Also, having twenty minutes of logistics at the beginning of every class felt excessive for a senior-level course
22. The homework assignments and exams were very labor-intensive since so many individual questions were asked.

#### **Selected Comments Econ 6302 Fall 2023**

1. First of all, Prof. Irina Panovska created a positive and inclusive learning environment by being very well-organized before, during and after the class. Her ability to explain complex concepts in a clear and engaging manner has made my learning experience both enjoyable and intellectually stimulating. Moreover, she reinforced my understanding of the course with Mini Lectures that she prepared in advance and uploaded to the E-learning platform, giving me a great resource that I can refer to for the rest of my life when I forget something. At the same time, as the teacher who best understood that we had a tiring and intense semester of classes, she made great suggestions that allowed us to learn about Dallas culturally and socially, and the people and activities that live here. In all these aspects, I believe that this course should remain the same.
2. Keep the prerecorded videos.
3. Good lectures
4. Everything looks perfect.
5. Professor Panovska always cares about students and she teaches very clearly!
6. The lecture notes may need a little bit more examples.
7. Maybe more details about the model rather than just math reasoning.
8. In all respects, it was an outstanding course. So, I could not find any flaws to improve it.
9. The course content is not easy to learn, but if you give enough effort, you will understand the material.
10. I'm extremely grateful to have had Prof. Panovska as my teacher this semester. Her dedication to excellence in teaching has left a lasting positive impact on my academic journey. I believe that she is a true asset to the educational community, and I look forward to the opportunity to learn from them again in the future.
11. Great Professor, no wonder she wins the educational award.
12. Dr. Panovska made life so simple and easy for all the students. She is a remarkable teacher.

**Spring 2023 (2 Classes, 4385/ 5397 cross listed as undergraduate and MS class Hybrid in-person and online), Econ 7391: Business Cycles PhD Field Class. No evaluation for Econ 7391 because this was an advanced PhD level class with less than 5 students, No Evaluations Issued to Preserve Student Anonymity)**

	<b>Econ 4385: Business and Economic Forecasting (Undergraduate, Cross Listed Hybrid)</b>	<b>Econ 5397: Business and Economic Forecasting (MS, Cross Listed Hybrid)</b>
Eligible to Respond	22	3
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The course was well organized	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.95,4.91 (0)	5,5 (0)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.95,4.91 (0.30)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>
Response Count	11	2

### **Selected comments Spring 2023**

1. Everything should be the same, this is the most valuable class I have taken at UTD; The material is very difficult but Dr. Panovska managed to make it digestible for undergraduate students
2. I think the breath and the depth o the subject matter was appropriate. I like how the class could be self-paced. The professor did a great job communicating expectations as well as supporting students at every step along the way.
3. The weekly quiz and exam format was good at keeping everyone at the same page
4. The homeworks were interesting and I like that we got to look at various types of data. The quizzes allowing multiple tries was helpful and allowed me to focus on learning the content.
5. I liked that it was emphasized that we did not need a coding background, and if you kept up with the work you learned how to use the code. But did not need experience writing code.
6. The homeworks are great for hands-on practice in programming the concepts learned in class. The grading criteria should stay the same. This course is a great starting point for learning R programming. The instructor designed the course very thoroughly. So that also should remain the same. The instructor shares a housekeeping session at the beginning of each class providing helpful information about the class and other relevant topics outside of the course, is very very useful to stay up to date which I think should be practiced in every course.
7. The option of hybrid learning is helpful as for programming it is sometimes easier to follow things on a screen than in person and recordings come very handy later.

**Fall 2022 (2 Classes, in person)**

	<b>Econ 6302 Macroeconomic Theory 1 (PhD 1<sup>st</sup> year core)</b>	<b>Econ 4386: Special Topics in Economics Contemporary Macroeconomic Policy (Undergraduate, New class added to university catalog)</b>
Eligible to Respond	15	24
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.78,4.69 (0.48)	4.97,4.94 (0.24)
The course was well organized	4.85,4.69 (0.63)	4.93,4.88 (0.33)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.78,4.69 (0.48)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.91,4.85 (0.38)	4.97,4.94 (0.24)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.85,4.69 (0.63)	4.93,4.88 (0.33)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.91,4.85 (0.38)	4.97,4.94 (0.24)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.96,4.92 (0.28)</b>	<b>4.97,4.94 (0.24)</b>
Response Count	13	16

**Selected comments Fall 2022**

- Econ 4386:
  - Assignments that required the usage of real-world resources were especially interesting and helpful, grading was fair and instructor was extremely willing to help out, loved the application of theory to real-world issues, enjoyed delving deeper into a specific issue to understand where theory is helpful and where it fell short
  - Everything 100% loved this class
  - The homeworks do an excellent job
  - The exam and homework are challenging due to the large time commitment
- Econ 6302:
  - Having videos online that walk through the concepts that we cover in class was extremely helpful
  - I appreciate the fact that online resources were provided for us to review
  - The organization of the course
  - Everything was understandable and the homework and the tests were fair. Dr. Panovska is great at explainin

**Spring 2022 (2 Classes, first 3 weeks taught online in synchronous format, in person after week 4, 4385/ 5397 cross listed as undergraduate and MS class)**

	<b>Econ 3311 Intermediate Macroeconomics (Undergraduate Required Core Class, New Preparation)</b>	<b>Econ 4385: Business and Economic Forecasting (Undergraduate)</b>	<b>Econ 5397: Business and Economic Forecasting (MS)</b>
Eligible to Respond	44	22	5
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.94,4.90 (0.31)	4.93,4.88 (0.35)	5,5 (0)
The course was well organized	4.94,4.90 (0.31)	4.83,4.75 (0.46)	5,5 (0)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.94,4.90 (0.31)	4.70,4.63 (0.52)	5,5 (0)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.97,4.95 (0.22)	5,5 (0)	5,5 (0)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.94,4.90 (0.31)	4.83,4.75 (0.46)	5,5 (0)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.97,4.95 (0.22)	4.93,4.88 (0.46)	5,5 (0)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.97,4.95 (0.22)</b>	<b>4.93,4.88 (0.35)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>
Response Count	22	8	1

**Selected comments Spring 2022**

- Econ 3311:
  - The organization was amazing in this course
  - I loved the structure of the class and how it was organized. I was able to access everything easily and received timely feedback on all assignments. If I had any questions and could not attend office hours, I could always ask questions in the weekly quizzes.
  - I enjoyed how detailed the slides were and how the professor was always making sure that we understood the material. She also made it very easy to reach out to her and ask questions (specifically by including a question section on every quiz). I hope I have the opportunity to be in more upper-level economics classes with her.
  - The knowledge of current and historical economic events from the professor impressed me and inspired me to learn more about economic events all over the world.
  - Loved this class. Was interesting, especially since it's relevant and we applied all concepts to the current world/ real data. You got what you expected if you studied and did the work for exams.
  - The course is very useful and accessible.
- Econ 4385:
  - I signed up for this class and was rather nervous because I expected the content of the class to be complex. Dr. P. did an outstanding job of taking something like forecasting and making it palatable, especially for students who haven't used R before. I am now resentful that I didn't have her for other classes because she is easily a top 2 most effective educator I have taken classes with. Also the material is some of the most directly applicable, valuable skills to take into the job market. I got a gig at Southwest and I shared with my interviewers that I had got (sic) my feet wet with forecasting and they loved that. Thank you so much Dr. P, professors like you are exactly what EPPS needs in order to produce top tier graduates [Student signed their evaluation, name redacted]

**Fall 2021 (2 Classes, first 5 weeks taught in hybrid synchronous format, in person after week 5)**

	<b>Econ 6302 Macroeconomic Theory 1 (PhD 1<sup>st</sup> year core)</b>	<b>Econ 4396: Special Topics in Economics Contemporary Macroeconomic Policy (Undergraduate, New class offered as a Special Topics Class)</b>
Eligible to Respond	5	22
The course objectives were clearly defined	5,5 (0)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
The course was well organized	5,5 (0)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
Overall, the course was excellent	5,5 (0)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	5,5 (0)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
The instructor communicated information effectively	5,5 (0)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	5,5 (0)	4.94,4.80 (0.63)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>	<b>4.94,4.80 (0.63)</b>
Response Count	5	10

**Selected comments Fall 2021**

- Econ 4396:
  - Dr. Panovska was great! The class was very interesting, well-paced, and I learned so much. Dr. Panovska is probably the best instructor I have had during my college career, and this was definitely the best class I have taken at UTD. I really appreciate her communication, the level of detail and clarity that her course materials have, and the care she puts into her lectures.
  - Homework and tests were a great challenge but doable.
  - I loved this class. Definitely my favorite this semester. Walking us through the math, the graphs, and such in detail was extremely helpful and appreciated.
  - I am holding on to my notes and perhaps making copies for safe keeping. I anticipate they'll be of great use to me in the coming years
- Econ 6302:
  - Everything in this course was clear and organized. I like it a lot. The professor explains everything very clearly.
  - The overall predictability of the course made it easier to navigate (especially for somebody with time restrictions). The comedic interludes helps (sic) break up the monotony of math equations after a long day (at work). The online notes and videos ensured that we had help outside of class in addition to yo (sic) office hours
  - Thank you Dr. Panovska for providing a wonderful firs year experience and introduction to UTD. I felt comfortable enough to ask questions in your class (even the ones that may appear obvious). The career and grad school advice given offered me a new outlook on both ends

**Spring 2021 (1 class, cross-listed graduate and undergraduate, taught online synchronously with mandatory asynchronous option)**

	<b>Econ 4385: Business and Economic Forecasting (Undergraduate)</b>	<b>Econ 5397: Special Topics Business and Economic Forecasting (MS Graduate)</b>
Eligible to Respond	23	6
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The course was well organized	4.89,4.82 (0.40)	5,5 (0)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.95,4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.95, 4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.95, 4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.95, 4.91 (0.30)	5,5 (0)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.95,4.91 (0)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>
Response Count	11	4

**Selected comments Spring 2021 (Econ 4385/5497)**

- Best professor to teach on this subject, she understands why many students struggle to learn coding languages in econ and she expertly accommodates that by providing the code for homework and explaining the code. She is always very gracious and understanding with the struggles of being a student and has done a lot to accommodate for that. Overall, Panovska is one of the best professors at UTD.
- This has been a both useful and interesting course. I liked that we got to pick our own topic for the final project, since I got to look at data that interested me. I also appreciated how Dr. Panovska was very knowledgeable about the topics, and was probably the most genuinely kind professor I've had at UTD. Overall, I really enjoyed the class and would recommend it to other students.

**Fall 2020 (2 Classes, taught online synchronously with mandatory asynchronous option)**

	<b>Econ 6302 Macroeconomic Theory 1 (PhD 1<sup>st</sup> year core)</b>	<b>Econ 7391: Special Topics in Economics Business Cycles (PhD Field)</b>
Eligible to Respond	10	7
The course objectives were clearly defined	5,5 (0)	4.5,4.5 (0.58)
The course was well organized	5,5 (0)	4.83, 4.75 (0.50)
Overall, the course was excellent	5,5 (0)	4.5, 4.5 (0.58)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	5,5 (0)	4.5, 4.5 (0.58)
The instructor communicated information effectively	5,5 (0)	4.83, 4.75 (0.5)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	5,5 (0)	4.83,4.75 (0.58)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>
Response Count	7	4

**Selected comments Fall 2020 (Econ 6302)**

- Lecture recordings, weekly tests, and optional additional videos for more understanding of the topic should remain the same. Also, data-related questions on the applicability of the model and individual feedbacks on each homework problem should also be retained.
- Short pre-recorded lecture videos were excellent.
- I really appreciated that there were so many alternative ways of referencing the material, from live lectures to recorded videos to the posted notes. Sometimes going through it in multiple ways made the material clearer than just trying to understand it through one source. The timely and thorough feedback was helpful. The homework answer keys were detailed and helped prepare for the exams.

**Spring 2020 (Cross-listed Undergraduate and Graduate Class. First half of the semester offered in person; second half post March 2020 offered online synchronously with mandatory asynchronous option)**

	<b>Econ 4385: Business and Economic Forecasting (Undergraduate)</b>	<b>Econ 5397: Special Topics Business and Economic Forecasting (Graduate MS)</b>
Eligible to Respond	19	4
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.86,4.78 (0.44)	5,5 (0)
The course was well organized	4.86,4.78 (0.44)	5,5 (0)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.75,4.67 (0.50)	5,5 (0)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.86,4.78 (0.44)	5,5 (0)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.86,4.78 (0.44)	4.75, 4.67 (0.58)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.86,4.78 (0.44)	5,5 (0)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.86,4.78 (0.44)</b>	<b>5,5 (0)</b>
Response Count	9	3

**Selected comments Spring 2020 (Econ 4385/5397)**

- The items taught, the professor, the code... everything was great.
- I like that the class was taught using a mix of statistical/econometric theory and more applied programming work. I appreciated that we used R rather than Stata as I feel it is more widely used in industry and will help with my upcoming job search. I feel Professor Panovska is truly a great professor and we're lucky to have her at UTD.
- Everything. The format and learning the material piece by piece was at a great pace. I enjoyed how the topics slowly built up from another and how each topic would be of use for future applications. In addition, the professor is flexible and very understanding especially with the given global crisis. The professor also offers guidance and resources at UTD to help the students transition through the semester. I appreciated and enjoyed the class very much. One of the best experiences I've received in an ECON course.
- The examples like GOT and Croatian GDP or Iceland and ice cream sales were really fun and helped illustrate the main ideas of what we were doing but made it less intimidating than the formulas made it seem to be which was helpful getting intuitive understanding. The homework were also pretty interesting and while it feels weird to admit it, kind of fun to do.

**Fall 2019 (1 Class)**

	<b>Econ 6302 Macroeconomic Theory 1 (New Preparation, 1<sup>st</sup> year PhD core)</b>
Eligible to Respond	10
The course objectives were clearly defined	4.80,4.57 (0.79)
The course was well organized	4.80,4.57 (0.79)
Overall, the course was excellent	4.80,4.43 (1.13)
The instructor was well prepared in the subject area	4.80 ,4.71 (0.49)
The instructor communicated information effectively	4.80,4.43 (1.13)
The instructor seemed genuinely interested in teaching	4.92,4.86 (0.38)
<b>Overall, this instructor was excellent</b>	<b>4.92,4.86 (0.38)</b>
Response Count	7

**Selected comments Fall 2019**

- I really appreciate this professor. She clearly teaches the material and communicates what we need to know. I

liked the reviews at the beginning of class of the material we learned the previous week. She also did a good job of communicating how the models we learned fit the actual data that we see.

- Dr. Panovska is a fantastic professor -- she is passionate about the subject matter, explains the material clearly, and goes above and beyond during office hours to answer questions. I looked forward coming to this class every week. She is very dedicated to her craft and establishes connections between the coursework (different macro models) and real-world applications even outside of economics. She is very approachable and builds caring relationships with students. Dr. Panovska is an asset to UTD and the EPPS faculty.

**Lehigh University Evaluations**

**Mean scores (standard deviations in parentheses). Median Scores Also Reported When Available (2015-onward). Department and College Averages Listed When Available (Spring 2018-onward)**

**Spring 2019 (2 classes, Online Only Evaluation Form with New Questions, Some questions customized by class)**

	<b>Eco 460/ 360: Time Series Analysis Cross listed graduate and undergraduate elective</b>	<b>Eco 029: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets. Core class, required for all college of Business Students</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	15	90
Instructor Presented Course Content in an Organized Manner	5 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department Mean 4.36 College Mean 4.48	4.59 (0.67) Median 5/5 Department Mean 4.36 College Mean 4.48
Instructor's teaching methods contributed to my understanding of the course material	5 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.45 College Mean 4.53	4.39 (0.83) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.45 College Mean 4.53
The instructor was responsive when I had difficulties or questions	5 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.20 College mean 4.36	4.39 (0.83) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.20 College mean 4.36
The instructor gave constructive feedback	5 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.20 College mean 4.45	3.99 (0.78) Median 4/5 Department mean 4.20 College mean 4.45
The assignments provided opportunities for participative learning	5 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.20 College mean 4.45	4.25 (0.93) Median 4/5 Department mean 4.20 College mean 4.45
The course increased my knowledge of the subject matter	5 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.54 College mean 4.57	4.35 (0.92) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.54 College mean 4.57
Number of Respondents	11	42

**Fall 2018 (2 classes, New Online Only Evaluation Form with New Questions)**

	<b>Eco 201: Federal Reserve Challenge Experiential learning class</b>	<b>Eco 365: Business, Government, and Macroeconomic Policy. Undergraduate and graduate elective</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	16	25
Instructor Presented Course Content in an Organized Manner	4.90 (0.32) Median 5/5 Department Mean 4.45 College Mean 4.49	4.84 (0.34) Median 5/5 Department Mean 4.45 College Mean 4.49
Instructor's teaching methods contributed to my understanding of the course material	5.00 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.39 College Mean 4.36	4.89 (0.32) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.39 College Mean 4.36
The instructor was responsive when I had difficulties or questions	4.90 (0.32) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.53 College mean 4.54	5.00 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.53 College mean 4.54
The instructor gave constructive feedback	4.90 (0.32) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.47 College mean 4.48	4.95 (0.23) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.47 College mean 4.48
The assignments provided opportunities for participative learning	5.00 (0.32) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.47 College mean 4.47	4.95 (0.23) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.47 College mean 4.47
The course increased my knowledge of the subject matter	5.00 (0.00) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.62 College mean 4.57	4.95 (0.23) Median 5/5 Department mean 4.62 College mean 4.57
Number of Respondents	10	19

**Spring 2018 (3 classes= 2 regular classes+1 co-taught research seminar)**

**Note: New Online Only Evaluation Form with Shortened Evaluation Window**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets. Core class, required for all college of Business students</b>	<b>Eco 460/ 360 Time Series Analysis (cross listed)* Cross listed graduate and undergraduate elective</b>	
Number of Grades Assigned	85	22	Recalculated Averages*
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.71 (0.96), median 5/5	4.56 (0.95) Median 5/5	4.75 (0.46) median 5/5
Average Course Quality	4.60 (0.95) median 5/5	4.56 (0.95) Median 5/5	4.75 (0.46) median 5/5
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.50 (0.97), median 5/5	4.63 (0.97) Median 5/5	4.88 (0.35) median 5/5
I would recommend this course to other students	4.67 (0.90) median 5/5	4.75 (0.99) Median 5/5	4.88 (0.35) median 5/5
Number of Respondents	48	9	8*

\* For eco 460/ 360 there was one outlier evaluation that skewed the average due to the low sample size. The right column reports the calculated averages when excluding that single observation.

- **Economics 418: Advanced Topics in Macroeconomics, Spring 2018**, 3 credits, 1 grade assigned (overload research seminar co-taught with Alex Nikolsko-Rzhevskyy), no evaluations available because there was 1 student in the class

**Fall 2017 (2 classes)**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business students</b>	<b>Eco 365: Business, Government, and Macroeconomic Policy Undergraduate and graduate elective, writing intensive</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	74	21
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.75 (0.64), median 5/5	4.63 (0.60) Median 5/5
Average Course Quality	4.67 (0.51) median 5/5	4.68 (0.48) Median 5/5
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.54 (0.73), median 5/5	4.26 (0.81) Median 5/5
I would recommend this course to other students	4.63 (0.86) median 5/5	4.89 (0.32) Median 5/5
Number of Respondents	52	19

**Spring 2017 (2 classes)**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business students</b>	<b>Eco 460/ 360 (cross listed) Cross listed graduate and undergraduate elective</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	176	18
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.64 (0.64), median 5/5	4.80 (0.41), median 5/5
Average Course Quality	4.67 (0.62) median 5/5	4.93 (0.26) median 5/5
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.53 (0.79), median 5/5	4.87 (0.35), median 5/5
I would recommend this course to other students	4.71 (0.63) median 5/5	4.87 (0.35) median 5/5
Number of Respondents	114	15

**Fall 2016 (2 classes)**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business students</b>	<b>Eco 365: Business, Government, and Macroeconomic Policy Undergraduate and graduate elective, writing intensive</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	84	20
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.63 (0.64), median 5/5	4.83 (0.38) Median 5/5
Average Course Quality	4.63 (0.64) median 5/5	4.78 (0.43) Median 5/5
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.50 (0.68), median 5/5	4.72 (0.46) Median 5/5
I would recommend this course to other students	4.67 (0.63) median 5/5	4.83 (0.38) Median 5/5
Number of Respondents	60	18

**Spring 2016 (2 classes)**

		<b>Cross-Listed Separate Evaluation Forms for Time Series Analysis</b>	
	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business students</b>	<b>Eco 460 (3 credits) (New Preparation) Graduate elective</b>	<b>Eco 395 (3 Credits) (New Preparation) Undergraduate elective, new class added to catalog</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	253	12	5
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.35(0.87), median 5/5	5 (0), median 5/5	5 (0), median 5/5
Average Course Quality	4.38 (0.86) median 5/5	5 (0) median 5/5	5 (0) median 5/5
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.28 (0.90), median 5/5	5 (0), median 5/5	5 (0), median 5/5
I would recommend this course to other students	4.51 (0.80) median 5/5	5 (0) median 5/5	5 (0) median 5/5
Number of Respondents	111	8	4

**Fall 2015 (2 classes)**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business Students</b>	<b>Eco 365: Business, Government, and Macroeconomic Policy Undergraduate and graduate elective writing intensive</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	84	23
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.53 (0.90), median 5/5	4.68 (0.57) Median 5/5
Average Course Quality	4.50 (0.66) median 5/5	4.82 (0.39) Median 5/5
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.32 (0.68), median 5/5	4.32 (0.78) Median 5/5
I would recommend this course to other students	4.65 (1.03) median 5/5	4.91 (0.29) Median 5/5
Number of Respondents	34	22

**Spring 2015 (2 classes, 2 sections of Eco 29)**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business Students</b>	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business Students</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	146	164
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.37 (0.78)	4.03 (0.87)
Average Course Quality	4.48 (0.76)	4.11 (0.84)
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.20 (0.81)	3.98 (0.84)
I would recommend this course to other students	4.63 (0.56)	4.32 (0.82)
Number of Respondents	81	87

**Fall 2014 (2 classes)**

	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business Students</b>	<b>Eco 365: Business, Government, and Macroeconomic Policy Undergraduate and Graduate Elective, writing-intensive</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	132	20
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.16 (0.94)	4.63 (0.50)
Average Course Quality	4.30 (0.76)	4.84 (0.37)
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.23 (0.89)	4.74 (0.45)
I would recommend this course to other students	4.53 (0.76)	4.95 (0.23)
Number of Respondents	57	19

**Spring 2014 (2 classes, 2 section of Eco 29)**

	<b>New Preparation</b>	
	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business Students</b>	<b>Eco 29: Money, Banking, and Financial Markets Core class, required for all College of Business Students</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	122	92
Average Teaching Effectiveness	3.54 (1.13)	3.53 (1.25)
Average Course Quality	3.70 (1.04)	3.61 (1.15)
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	3.70 (1.05)	3.63 (1.28)
I would recommend this course to other students	3.87 (1.19)	3.90 (1.25)
Number of Respondents	61	51

**Fall 2013 (1 class)**

	<b>New Preparation Eco 365: Business, Government, and Macroeconomic Policy Undergraduate and graduate elective</b>
Number of Grades Assigned	19
Average Teaching Effectiveness	4.29 (0.91)
Average Course Quality	4.36 (0.74)
I learned a Great Deal in this Class	4.50 (0.85)
I would recommend this course to other students	4.36 (1.08)
Number of Respondents	14